

Independent Review Appendices

Appendix A - References

The Accounts and Audit (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2010

Local Authority Pay Policy Statements 2024/25 – unless stated

- Torfaen
- Newport
- Caerphilly
- Blaenau Gwent
- Neath Port Talbot
- Merthyr Tydfil
- Powys
- Swansea 2023
- Vale of Glamorgan
- Carmarthenshire
- Pembrokeshire
- Ceredigion
- Cardiff
- Bridgend

- Herefordshire
- Worcestershire 2023/2024
- Somerset
- Bristol 2023
- Birmingham
- Shropshire
- South Gloucester
- Bath and NE Somerset
- Reading
- Swindon
- Windsor and Maidenhead
- Slough
- North Devon
- Gloucester

Welsh Government

- Pay Letter ESP(W) 02/2022 – pay arrangements for NHS employees covered by executive and senior pay terms and conditions of service.
- Pay Policy Statement 2022 – Welsh Government Pay Bands (Delegated Staff and Senior Civil Service) 22nd March 2023 – Senior Civil Service Salaries Annexe A

Borough Council Documents:

2023/24 Final Draft Pay Policy Document

Appendix B - Reviewer Biography

Anne Phillimore is a Chartered Fellow of the Chartered Institute of Personnel and Development. Anne had a career in Human Resources spanning a number of public sector organisations including the Post Office, the Ombudsman's Office and as Head of Industrial Relations and Workforce Planning in Customs and Excise. In 2004 Anne returned to Wales to take up the role of Director of Personnel in a North Glamorgan NHS Trust, moving in 2009 to take up the role of Executive Director of Workforce and Organisational Development in the newly formed Aneurin Bevan Health Board in Gwent from which she retired in 2015. Subsequently Anne has run her own HR Consultancy business, mainly working in the Welsh public sector including a 10 month period as Interim Executive Director of Workforce and OD for Cwm Taf Morgannwg University Health Board shortly after it was put into special measures. Anne also sits as a lay member of the Nursing and Midwifery Council Conduct and Competency Committee and was a member of the independent NHS Pay Review Body between March 2020 and June 2023. Throughout her career Anne has been responsible for leading and delivering value added workforce interventions and change in a range of organisations and cultures.

Appendix C

Comparative Local Authority Salaries (Information from published Pay Policies*) – South and mid Wales

(population sizes for LAs are sourced from the Office of National Statistics – Census 2021)

Local Authority	Tier 1	Salary £s	Tier 2 Chief Officer	Salary £s	Tier 3 Chief Officer	Salary £s	Tier 4 Chief Officer	Salary £s	Tier 5 Chief Officer	Salary £s	Tier 6**	Salary £s
Merthyr Tydfil 24/25 P:58,800	CEO Fixed point	129,270	Deputy CEO (fixed point)	105,377			Directors / Head of Service Group B (4 Pts)	79,566–86,660	Head of Service Group C (4 Pts)	71,720 – 78,859	Head of Service Group D (4 Pts)	63,393 – 70,532
Blaenau Gwent 24/25 P:66,900	CEO (5pts)	108,573 – 116,934			Chief officers (5 Pts)	88,392–97,032	Head of Service JNC 5 (5 Pts)	78,825–86,507	Head of Service JNC 4 (5 Pts)	71,112–78,023	Head of Service JNC 3 (5 Pts)	68,955 – 75,650
Ceredigion 24/25 P:71,500	CEO (4 pts)	129,755 – 138,647			Corporate Directors (4 points)	104,202 – 111,337	Corporate Lead Officer A2 (4pts)	84,846–90,164	Corporate Lead Officer A1 (4 pts)	77,796–83,085		
Torfaen 2024 P:92,300	CEO Grade 20 (6pts)	115,840 – 132,023 (actual 132,023)	Assistant CEO Grade 18 (6 pts) (grade 19 not in use)	101,852 – 111,405	Chief Officers Grade 17 (6 pts)*	91,489–99,516	Heads of Service Grade 16 (4pts)	83,671–89,545	Heads of Service Grade 15 (4pts)	76,706–81,869	Heads of Service Grade 14 (4pts)	68,924 – 75,150
Monmouthshire 24/25 P: 93,000	CEO fixed point	128,008	Deputy Chief Executive Band A+ (3 Pts)	98,394–100,965	Chief Officer Band A (4 Pts)	90,683–94,538	Head of Service Band B (4 Pts)	79,114–82,970	Head of Service Band C (4 Pts)	68,188–75,901	Head of Service Band D (4 Pts)	61,119 – 66,261

Pembroke shire 24/25 P: 123,400	CEO fixed point	150,922	Directors (5 inc)	120,857 - 132,743	Head of service Band 1 (5 inc)	105,050 - 115,355	Head of service Band 2 (5 inc)	95,355- 104,686	Head of service Band 3 (5 inc)	86,864- 95,355	Head of service Band 4 (5 inc)	80,806 - 88,683
Vale of Glamorga n 24/25 p: 131,800	CEO fixed point	147,639	Directors 5 points	101,903 - 113,004			Heads of Service 5 points	77,747- 86,164	Ops Manager - level 1 (5 pts)	57,839- 63,420	Managers - level 2 (5 pts)	55,045 - 60,350
Powys 24/25 P: 133,200	CEO (4pts)	144,512 - 154,131		-	Director 1 (4 pts)	106,682 - 114,280	Director 2 (4 pts)	94,282- 101,889	Heads of Service 1 (4 pts)	85,411- 92,773	Heads of Service 2 (4 pts)	75,598 - 82,960
Neath Port Talbot 24/25 P: 142,300	CEO 5 point s	141,811 - 155,792	Corporate Directors 5 points	117370- 126,424	Chief Finance Officer 5 points	95,609- 105,213	Heads of Service (5 points)	81,966- 89,958	Strategic Managers	58,771- 64,049		
Bridgend 24/25 P:145,500	CEO Trent Grad e 25 4 pts	142,125 - 152,170	Assistant CEO Trent Grade 24 (4 pts)	127,476 - 136,691	Corporat e Director 1 Trent Grade 23 (4 pts)	115,845 - 121,212	Corporat e Director 2 Trent Grade 24 (4 pts)	100,349 - 107,202	Head of Service 1 Trent Grade 21 (4 pts)	87,382- 93,193	Heads of service 2 Trent Grade 20 (4 pts)	<div></div> 78,895 - 84,245
Newport Feb 2024 p: 159, 600	CEO (4 pts)	135,842 - 156,235	Strategic Directors (4 pts)	114,391 - 124,429					Heads of Service (4 pts)	84,919- 91,289		
Caerphilly 24/25 P: 175,900	CEO fixed point	153,111	Deputy CEO	145,903	Director (4 pts)	125,025 - 138,695			Band A Heads of Service (4 pts)	95.900- 106,33 4	Band B (4 pts)	74,553 - 82,617

Carmarthen-shire 24/25 P: 187,900	CEO fixed point	161,638 (1.4.23)	Directors (4 pts)	130,604 - 140,369	Assistant CEO (4 pts)	111,662 - 117,571	Heads of Service (4 pts)	94,497- 103,860				
Swansea 23/24 24/25 policy = no salary data P:238,500	CEO fixed point	158,887			Director (7 pts)	109,182 - 123,681	Chief Officers (9 pts)	92,246- 112,611	Heads of Service Band 1 (7 pts)	75,311- 92,246	Heads of Service Band 2 (7 pts)	64,021 - 80,955
Cardiff 24/25 P:362,400	CEO fixed point	196,744	Corporate Director (resources, People and Community) (fixed point)	150,920	Directors x 5 (fixed point) Chief Digital Officer (fixed point)	139,463 112,352	Chief Officer/ Assistant Director Fixed point)	95,474	Ops Managers level 1 (5 points)	63.391- 76,615	Ops Managers level 2 (5 points)	52,241 - 62,691

Appendix D

Comparative Local Authority Salaries (Information from published Pay Policies) – English examples*

Local Authority	Tier 1	Salary £	Tier 2	Salary £	Tier 3	Salary £	Tier 4	Salary £	Tier 5	Salary £	Tier 6	Salary £
North Devon 2024 P:98,600	CEO	102,082 (lowest paid CIPFA CEO)	DCEO Director SML16	86,034	Head of Service	58,225-70,648	Senior Legal	47,420-56,505				
Worcester - 23/24 <i>(Most Director salaries inc. retention supplements 10-18%)</i> P:103,900	MD (4 pts) 35 hrs	120,938-124,336	Corporate Directors 5 pts	87,805-93,526	Deputy Director 2 posts	76,365-82,085 (5 pts)	Head of Service 6 posts	64,924-70,644 (5 pts)				
Gloucester- 2024 p:132,500	CEO	131,153	JS4	94,132-103,829	JS3	79,852-88,047	JS2	63,504-77,015	JS1	54,296-62,672		
Windsor and Maidenhead (UA) P:153,500	CEO	155,324-198,172	Executive Directors	109,073-150,451 (gateway grades at all levels)	Deputy Directors	96,625-114,585	Asst Directors	74,572-104,159	Local pay grade 13	72,996-92,580	Local pay grade 12	65,129-84,193

Slough (UA) 24/25 (11 Senior Director vacancies from 25 posts) P:158,500	CEO	152,330-182,400	Executive Directors (6)	125,733-146,319 (market supplement s £601-3,629)	SML14 Director	104,521 - 119,233	SML13	87,523-101,749	SML12	76,261-84,727 (market supplement (£5.146)		
Reading UA 24/25 P:174,200	CEO	177,942	Director posts	107,910-133,713	Director posts (RMSA)	88,679-103,255	RMSB	78,470-91,590	RMSC	66,805-82,846	RMSD	59,515-71,178
Hereford-Shire (UA) 24/25 P: 187,100	CEO fixed point	164,848	Director 1 (ceiling salary)	139,465	Director 2 (ceiling salary)	114,261	Head of Service (HoS 1) 3 points	90,249-95,076	Head of Service (HoS 2) 3 points	83,471-87,929	13HC	61,734-66,738
Bath and NE Somerset UA 24/25 P:193,400	CEO	165,000	Directors 2 posts	128,055 and 120,169	Director 6 posts	109,329 - 115,648	Senior Manager 4 roles	96,704-103,255	G15 (JNC) 2 posts	86,672-93,181	G13 (JNC) 1 role	60,205-65,858
N Somerset (UA) 1.4.24 P:216,700	CEO	195,000	Leadership Team Spot salaries based on JE & market	125,000-150,00			SD1 Service Delivery Mgrs.	115,000-118,000	SD2	110,000 - 115,000	SD3	100,000-105,000

Swindon UA April 24 P: 233,400	CEO	175,432	Corporate Directors 4	132,184- 175,581	Dir/Asst Director 9	98,502- 130,672	Senior Manage rs 4 bands	75,000- 95,000	Senior Manage rs 5 bands	50,000- 75,000		
Bristol City Council December (UA) 2023 P:279,765	CEO Level 1	185,673-	Executive Directors Level 2	106,878- 150,781	Directors Level 3	100,000 Approx. 130,410						
South Gloucester UA Jan 24 P:290,400	CEO	180,426	Directors 4 posts	135,791- 145,181	Director 1 post	110,933 - 118,117	Senior Manage rs 18 posts	91,780- 100,160	Senior Manage rs	82,204- 89,385		
Shropshire UA 23/24 P:323,600	CEO	167,143	C2 Executive Director	134,113- 145,123	C3 Director	117,598 - 123,103	C4 Asst Director	101,083- 105,588	C5 Head of Service	90,073- 95,678	C6 Service Manager	73,558- 84,568
Birmingham 23/24 P:1,144,900	CEO B04	295,093	Corporate Director B03	148,087- 221,134	Service Director B02	111,220 - 165,834	Asst Director s B01	82,920- 123,399	NCJ pay spines			

Appendix E(i) Pay Benchmarks – Tier 1

Council	Salary £	
North Devon	102,082	
Blaenau Gwent	116,934	
Worcestershire	124,336	
Monmouthshire	128,008	
Merthyr Tydfil	129,270	
Gloucester	131,153	
Torfaen	132,023	lower quartile range
Ceredigion	138,647	lower quartile range
Vale of Glamorgan	147,639	
Pembrokeshire	150,922	
Bridgend	152,170	
Caerphilly	153,111	
Powys	154,131	
Neath Port Talbot	155,792	
Newport	156,235	mid point
Swansea	158,887	
Carmarthenshire	161,638	
Herefordshire	164,848	
Bath and NE Somerset	165,000	
Shropshire	167,143	
Swindon	175,432	
Reading	177,942	top quartile range
South Gloucester	180,426	top quartile range
Slough	182,400	
Bristol City	185,673	
Somerset	195,000	
Cardiff	196,744	
Windsor and Maidenhead	198,172	
Birmingham	295,093	

Appendix E(ii) Pay Benchmarks – Tier 2

Council	Salary £	
Blaenau Gwent	0	
Powys	0	
Swansea	0	
Ceredigion	0	
North Devon	86,034	
Worcestershire	93,526	
Monmouthshire	100,965	
Gloucester	103,829	
Merthyr Tydfil	105,377	
Torfaen	111,405	lower quartile range
Vale of Glamorgan	113,004	lower quartile range
Newport	124,429	
Neath Port Talbot	126,424	
Bath and NE Somerset	128,055	
Pembrokeshire	132,743	
Reading	133,713	
Bridgend	136,691	mid point
Herefordshire	139,465	
Carmarthenshire	140,369	
Shropshire	145,123	
South Gloucester	145,181	
Caerphilly	145,903	
Slough	146,319	upper quartile range
Somerset	150,000	upper quartile range
Windsor and Maidenhead	150,451	
Bristol City	150,781	
Cardiff	150,920	
Swindon	175,581	
Birmingham	221,134	

Appendix E(iii) Pay Benchmarks – Tier 3

Council	Salary £	
Merthyr Tydfil	0	
Newport	0	
Vale of Glamorgan	0	
Somerset	0	
North Devon	70,648	
Worcestershire	82,085	
Gloucester	88,047	
Monmouthshire	94,538	
Blaenau Gwent	97,032	
Torfaen	99,516	lower quartile range
Reading	103,255	lower quartile range
Neath Port Talbot	105,213	
Ceredigion	111,337	
Herefordshire	114,261	
Powys	114,280	
Windsor and Maidenhead	114,585	
Pembrokeshire	115,355	mid point
Bath and NE Somerset	115,648	
Carmarthenshire	117,571	
South Gloucester	118,117	
Slough	119,233	
Bridgend	121,212	
Shropshire	123,103	upper quartile range
Swansea	123,681	upper quartile range
Bristol City	130,410	
Swindon	130,672	
Caerphilly	138,695	
Cardiff	139,463	
Birmingham	165,834	

Appendix E(iv) Pay Benchmarks – Tier 4

Council	Salary £	
Carmarthenshire	0	
Worcestershire	0	
Bristol City	0	
North Devon	56,505	
Vale of Glamorgan	63,420	
Gloucester	77,015	
Monmouthshire	82,970	
Blaenau Gwent	86,507	
Merthyr Tydfil	86,660	lower quartile range
Torfaen	89,545	
Neath Port Talbot	89,958	
Ceredigion	90,164	
Newport	91,289	
Reading	91,590	
Swansea	92,246	
Bridgend	93,193	mid point
Swindon	95,000	mid point
Herefordshire	95,076	
Cardiff	95,474	
South Gloucester	100,160	
Slough	101,749	
Powys	101,889	
Bath and NE Somerset	103,255	
Windsor and Maidenhead	104,159	upper quartile range
Pembrokeshire	104,686	
Shropshire	105,588	
Caerphilly	106,334	
Somerset	118,000	
Birmingham	123,399	

Appendix F: Local Authority Benchmarks Ranked By Population*

Rank by Pop size	Welsh LA Benchmark (All UAs)	Pop	English LA Benchmark (*=UA)	pop	Joint LA benchmark	pop
1	Merthyr T	58,500	N. Devon	97,600	Merthyr T	58,500
2	Blaenau G	66,900	Worcester	103,900	Blaenau G	66,900
3	Ceredigion	71,500	Gloucester	132,500	Ceredigion	71,500
4	Torfaen	92,300	Windsor *	153,500	Torfaen	92,300
5	Monmouthshire	93,300	Slough*	158,500	Monmouthshire	93,300
6	Pembrokeshire	123,400	Reading*	174,200	N. Devon	97,600
7	Vale of Glam.	131,800	Herefordshire*	187,100	Worcester	103,900
8	Powys	133,200	Bath*	193,400	Pembrokeshire	123,400
9	Neath PT	142,300	N. Somerset*	193,400	Vale of Glam	131,800
10	Bridgend	145,500	Swindon*	233,400	Gloucester	132,500
11	Newport	159,600	Bristol City*	279,765	Powys	133,200
12	Caerphilly	175,900	S. Gloucester*	290,400	Neath PT	142,300
13	Carms	187,900	Shropshire*	323,600	Bridgend	145,500
14	Swansea	238,500	Birmingham	1,144,900	Windsor	153,500
15	Cardiff	362,400			Slough	158,500
16					Newport	159,600
17					Reading	174,200
18					Caerphilly	175,900
19					Herefordshire	187,100
20					Carmarthenshire	187,900
21					Bath	193,400
22					N. Somerset	193,400
23					Swindon	233,400
24					Swansea	238,500
25					Bristol	279,765
26					S. Gloucester	290,400
27					Shropshire	323,600
28					Cardiff	363,400
29					Birmingham	1,144,900

*Population figures based on ONS 2021 National Census Data

Table 1 -Key

Lower quartile

Median

Upper Quartile

Appendix G

Salary Levels for NHS Wales CEOs and Directors 1st April 2022 (WG Pay Letter ESP(W) 02/2022*- as at 23.3.23

Pay Point	Salary Band Minimum £s	Salary Band Maximum £s	Notes
20	208,721	225,529	CEO large Health Board e.g. Cardiff and Vale, ABUHB
19	191,913	207,600	
18	180,706	191,838	
17	169,502	179,587	
16	163,900	168,382	
15	152,695	162,780	Indicative DoF ABUHB
14	141,488	151,574	Indicative =Director AB, Finance (DoF) CTM
13	130,282	140,368	Indicative =Director CTM
12	124,680	129,163	
11	119,078	123,560	
10	113,475	117,958	
9	107,872	112,355	
8	102,269	106,753	(overlaps B 9 Agenda for Change)
7	96,688	101,150	(overlaps B 9 Agenda for Change)

- * there is a separate salary scale for Medical Directors and Directors of Public Health
- Expectation is that a new appointment is made to the bottom of the appropriate pay scale – there is no right to progress up the scale – progression is exceptional and would be agreed with Board remuneration committees and WG
- Pay points determined by job evaluation so will vary depending on organisational context
- WG can agree spot salaries
- The Director holding the role of Deputy CEO is entitled to an additional allowance of £10k

Appendix H

Welsh Government Senior Civil Service and Senior Delegated Staff Pay Bands – Welsh Government Pay Policy Statement 2022 (March 2023)

Pay Bands Senior Civil Service*	Pay Point	Salary £s
Permanent Secretary (Tier 1,2, and 3)	Maximum	200,000
	Minimum	142,000
Director Generals (SCS Pay Band 3)	Maximum	208,100
	Minimum	120,000
Director (SCS Pay Band 2)	Maximum	162,500
	Minimum	93,000
Deputy Director (SCS Pay Band 1)	Maximum	117,800
	Minimum	71,000

Pay Bands Delegated Staff

Grade 6	4 points	64,520-75,480
Grade 7	4 points	51,380-61,440

- *Senior Civil Service pay Bands are set by the UK Government delegated staff pay bands by Welsh Government